

RWC Transport Review of 1st Weekend 9 – 11 September 2011

OVERVIEW

On 9 September approximately 370,000 people travelled on public transport (bus, rail and ferry) over a 20 hour period. This compares to approximately 240,000 on a normal weekday. This was substantially greater than the planning scenarios which had been agreed and peer reviewed.

This report is the result of a review of transport and traffic management during the weekend of September 9-11. The report focuses on risk management and forward actions as Rugby World Cup activities unfold in the region in coming weeks.

The aim of the report is to provide the Mayor, Council, Government and other stakeholders assurance that issues which occurred on the rail network in particular have been identified, addressed and wherever possible mitigated.

Rail services are provided under a contractual arrangement to Auckland Transport by Veolia Transdev, a contract that has been in place for seven years.

Assurances were given by Veolia that measures would be put in place to address customer concerns following the Bledisloe Cup match in August 2011. Despite these assurances, it is clear these measures were not implemented. While Friday night's event placed unprecedented pressure on the rail network in particular, the customer experience for many patrons was unacceptable and fell short of our expectations of service performance.

Auckland Transport has now therefore directed that Veolia undertake immediate improvements in a number of areas and will implement key actions to address issues that arose on 9 September.

| Issue | Action |
|--|--|
| Poor communication to customers | Auckland Transport staff placed in Veolia control room to ensure communications to train staff and MAXX Contact Centre |
| Lack of announcements on trains | Additional dedicated Veolia staff on all trains to make announcements |
| Crowding on trains | Veolia directed to limit loadings to 10% below maximum |
| Security on trains and use of Emergency Activation Buttons | Security Staff in all carriages. Police event plan to include increased presence on trains and at major stations |
| People moving on to tracks | Security presence at all points of potential access to the tracks between Britomart and Kingsland. |
| Difficulty in managing large crowds at Britomart | 40 additional security staff at Britomart (now 100 staff), corralling outside CPO and Takutai Square and improvement in Public Announcement system |
| Lack of rail capacity to handle passenger volumes | 100 additional buses provided. New Special Event service to Eden Park and additional contingency buses spread around rail network. |

In addition to addressing concerns around rail performance, there will be 100 more buses and drivers employed to complement rail services for future events. More buses would have been available on 9 September had they not been required for peak services and school bus services. Most major future events will take place on weekends, meaning that buses will be available and deployed in addition to rail services.

Overlaying the actions above, communications for the upcoming events will more clearly identify the range of options available for travel to the games and the Downtown FanZone. These options include public transport, walking and private car.

The event Traffic Management Plans (TMP) anticipate 50% - 70% of patrons travelling by private vehicle. The Parking/Traffic schemes are being reviewed to ensure sufficient contingency is available if higher proportions travel by car. Then major impact will be on demand for parking and a safe walking route to the venue.

In recognising the seriousness of the weekend's events, the Board of Auckland Transport has initiated an urgent and independent enquiry into all aspects of transport operations. This will be conducted by Chris Moore of Meredith Connell and will include consideration of operational and contractual responsibilities. The Terms of Reference for that enquiry are attached.

BACKGROUND

RWC Transport Operations Plan

This blueprint for transport operations was developed over 3 years.

The Operations Plan developed for each stadium evolved from information from previous large events held at each venue which included traffic operations, parking arrangements and public transport usage during that time.

The RWC Transport Operations Plan provides an overview of the Traffic Management Plans for each competition venue, FanZones and Training Venues. The plan also outlines the rail and special event bus services to be provided for the RWC2011. The TMP for the competition venues is supported by detail traffic implementation plans that outline the location, timings and type of signage and traffic treatments to be installed at each of the competition venues.

The TMP for Eden Park was completed and signed off by the Central Traffic Work-stream in April 2010.

Both Eden Park and North Harbour Stadium TMPs were peer reviewed in 2010 by Melbourne based Traffix Group with excellent results. There were a number of minor recommendations that were implemented for example, improved signage outside of venues. It is acknowledged that in coming weeks these plans may need adjustment to reflect changes and waterfront activities.

9 September 2001

The number of people attending the combined opening night festivities and Rugby World Cup at Eden Park, placed significant strain on all public infrastructure, but in particular transport.

The opening night of RWC 2011 saw more than 200,000 people enter the relatively confined areas of the Auckland CBD, near Queen's Wharf. A further 60,000 people attended the match at Eden Park. All of these festivities took place on a normal Friday with its associated demand for peak-time commuting to and from the CBD.

Transport planning was based on the agreed event plan for the CBD.

On 9 September approximately 370,000 people travelled on public transport (bus, rail and ferry) over a 20 hour period. This compares to approximately 240,000 on a normal weekday. This was substantially greater than the planning scenarios which had been agreed and peer reviewed.

Advice provided to Auckland Transport by the event organisers indicated that the anticipated numbers attending the CBD Waterfront public celebration event was 30,000 to 50,000 people.

Previous experience has been that for events in the Auckland CBD around 10% - 30% travel in by public transport. Given international experience and recent Eden Park usage, it was estimated that 30% - 50% of the crowd would come by public transport. Of the public transport passengers 20% would be by rail, 70% by bus and 10% by ferry.

Based on the event crowd estimates this would have meant 3,000 to 5,000 additional rail passengers. Veolia's Operation Plan allowed for capacity of 8,000 rail passengers to the CBD to cater for this demand.

Factors contributing to increased crowd sizes included the opening being on a weekday, schools and businesses closing early and perfect weather.

The consequence of overcrowding near Queens Wharf led to a number of adverse effects including an inability to load and unload trains quickly at Britomart, and the blocking of egress from the Ferry Terminal.

These one-off factors led to trains and some buses being at passenger capacity from late morning. Capacity issues, particularly on the rail network were exacerbated by various incidents, the first of which was reported at approximately 12.45pm.

Documented incidents throughout the network but particularly on the Southern Line exacerbated the situation and cumulatively led to mounting problems through the afternoon.

RAIL

Disruption caused by incidents such as people walking on tracks, unruly behaviour on board (e.g. fighting and fire extinguishers being released) and emergency stop buttons being repeatedly pressed resulted in trains being forced to stop. All of these incidents are serious safety issues that cause significant delays because the operator is required to stop the train before investigating and clearance for the journey to continue. In some cases trains were held up for more than an hour before the issues were resolved.

It is clear from reports provided both by Veolia and KiwiRail that some of these incidents included passengers legitimately seeking help for people who needed medical or other assistance. The delays throughout the network, including time delays loading and unloading at Britomart, meant that passengers on some services were left in some stationary carriages for unacceptably long periods. In isolation, a single incident may have caused only minor delays, but the cumulative effect of numerous incidents impacted exponentially across the entire rail network.

VEOLIA INCIDENT LOG – 9 September

Below is a list of rail incidents as called in by Veolia drivers and by train managers and logged by train control on the IRIS system.

It became clear that the numbers of customers using the trains was in excess of what we could comfortably cater for at about 12.30. All trains on the network arriving at Britomart were full to capacity and we had already started to receive comments from staff that customers were being left behind at stations.

Contingency buses were utilized where required and helped to clear some of the stations. However, as the afternoon continued our additional buses were not able to keep up with demand.

| | |
|-------|--|
| 13.44 | Person on track at Greenlane. Driver reports “near miss” and police called to attend. Train stopped until track cleared. |
| 14.19 | Passenger collapses on train at Newmarket. Ambulance called to attend. Train held at station until passenger safely moved onto platform to await ambulance. |
| 15.00 | As a result of the heavily loaded services entering Britomart Veolia instigated the plan to exit all customers through Takutai Square earlier than intended. Signage and barriers not set up, so Veolia staff set up area and introduce plan. |
| 15.03 | Passengers attempt to board moving train at Henderson after doors had been closed. Train stopped, space made and the customers let onboard. No one injured. |
| 15.09 | Driver of train 2243 reports children on tracks at Te Mahia. Police called. |
| 15.40 | Passenger faints on board due to crowding. The customer was assisted off the train at Middlemore and taken to hospital by an ambulance which met the train at the station, train delayed 12 minutes. |
| 16.20 | Emergency brake buttons activated on train at Panmure, causing emergency brakes to be applied. Train stopped and driver investigates before resetting system. A 35-minute delay causes knock-on delays to other trains. |
| 16.30 | Emergency services called to attend Mt Eden area (just east of the train station) as customers force train doors open and disembark onto tracks . All trains stopped until tracks clear. |
| 16.40 | Customer collapses on train and is moved to Platform 4 at Britomart for emergency medical treatment including CPR. Platform closed for 30 minutes. Emergency services arrive 20 minutes after called. |
| 16.50 | Reports of two people riding on outside of locomotive between Glen Innes and Meadowbank. Train is stopped at Meadowbank and Police called to investigate before train is allowed to continue to Britomart. |
| 17.45 | Emergency brake buttons activated on multiple occasions whilst train stopped at Newmarket. Passengers disembark. All trains stopped in the vicinity for safety reasons. A second train is called to take passengers. Incident brings Southern and Western line to a standstill until it was established the lines were clear of evacuating passengers. |
| 17.53 | As result of above incident, Train 3254 is stopped near The Strand for about 15 minutes. Customers force doors open and evacuate causing immediate suspension of services in and out of Britomart because of safety concerns. |
| 18.23 | Passengers repeatedly activate emergency buttons on train north of Parnell tunnel. All trains were stopped for safety reasons until system reset (takes longer when trains fully loaded with |

| | |
|-------|--|
| | standing passengers). Emergency services were called and assisted staff with a controlled evacuation. |
| 18.30 | Customers evacuate train between Remuera and Greenlane – forced to stop because of Newmarket incident. Customers force train doors open in response to heat, and long delays caused by the earlier incidents. Veolia staff and emergency services help remaining customers to safely disembark onto tracks. |
| 18.45 | Security staff lose control of Takutai Square entrance as a result of sheer number of people exiting the station. Barriers pushed aside by unruly crowds which meant people entering the station could not access/egress. Control regained at approximately 20.00 |
| 19.30 | A fire extinguisher used on a train at Kingsland station. Customers evacuated onto platform whilst train crew establish whether any fire occurred. Services delayed for 30 minutes. |
| 20.10 | Fighting reported on train at Sylvia Park. Train delayed whilst police attend. |
| 22.31 | Train driver reports possibly intoxicated female fallen onto tracks at Otahuhu . All trains stopped on that line whilst ambulance attended. |
| 00.18 | Passengers fighting on train 2274 results in injury . All trains stopped from entering Britomart to allow passage of this train into Britomart where it is met by emergency services. |

Other things to note:

- Numerous reports from our staff throughout the day of instances of verbal and physical assault and general disorder on trains from our staff.
- Alleged reports of Veolia staff being assaulted both verbally and physically on full trains and concerned for their personal safety.
- Escalators at Britomart kept stopping as a result of overloading caused by the sheer numbers of people using them. This slowed the exit from the platforms via Takutai end as it was taking between 10 to 15 minutes to clear them via narrow steps. It also meant that trains could not be loaded as quickly as required as platforms would have become too congested. Britomart fire evacuation limits compromised platform limit numbers.
- Trains were delayed at Britomart as they were unable to depart safely as a result of large volume of exiting customers being so close to the platform edges.
- There were no major train faults or infrastructure breakdowns this evening
- Staff attendance was not an issue and staff conducted themselves well in difficult circumstances
- Additional resources in Control on hand and used to ensure repeated customer announcements were made across the network – audibility was an issue at Britomart
- Very challenging position with regard to safety implications at Britomart – sheer numbers on the platform and in the station at any one time. Numbers on board likewise.
- For the return journey we experienced some issues as a result of train and staff displacement however, the main crowds were dealt with within 70 minutes of game end.

Auckland Transport has established a register (0800 hotline and on-line registration form) for those people who may have missed the Eden Park match due to transport-related delays. At the time of writing 16 people had registered.

Buses

Normal commuter services ran smoothly around the region on the morning of 9 September

Contingency plans saw extra bus services introduced to support the disrupted rail services. Back-up bus services (31 buses were on stand-by) were unable to clear the entire back-log.

By late morning contingency buses were redirected to Northern Busway operations. Between 11:30 and 20:00 a capacity was provided on average of approximately 190% of normal capacity, peaking mid-afternoon at 500% to 600% normal Friday capacity. Across the bus network, approximately +17% higher demand for commuter services was experienced with the commuter bus network performing well. This was in addition to Eden Park Special Event services. The bus commuter network beyond Eden Park Special Event services carried approximately 215,000 passengers as compared to a normal 185,000.

Pre-event marketing and publicity led to reduced traffic on key arterial routes into/out of the CBD such as Remuera Rd and Great North Rd (as high as 43% travel time reduction). This allowed buses in particular to run more quickly on the road network.

Ferries

At approximately 6pm severe crowd control issues and safety concerns forced the closure of the downtown ferry terminus and sailings were suspended as passengers were unable to dis-embark because of the large numbers of people at the bottom of the City blocking egress from the terminus. Note: Empty ferries were however brought in from around 7pm to transport passengers out of the CBD. Ferries carried some 34,000 passengers over the course of the day, which was 283% higher than a normal Friday (12,000).

North Harbour Stadium

Over the weekend of September 9-11 there were also two near capacity matches held at North Harbour Stadium (combined total of over 50,000).

As per the transport plan, significant bus and shuttle services were employed to support these events. Both events ran smoothly and without incident. All fans were seated well in advance of kick-off. Traffic flowed well around the vicinity and special event bus services were the highest ever recorded for the Stadium (average of 30% of crowd for both matches). On both days bus patrons were cleared within 65 minutes. See attached match day report.

ACTION PLAN

The following actions are being implemented for future matches

| Action Plan | |
|--|--|
| Emergency Stop Button (ESB) | |
| ESB1 | One security staff per carriage to deter Emergency Button activation - priority for all Special Event trains then all services from 1pm onwards |
| Security, Safety & Prevention of Overcrowding | |
| SSPO1 | Enhanced security at Britomart (100 staff previously 60). |
| SSPO2 | Britomart internal corralling and crowd management - review holding, loading and unloading processes to improve loading times (have customer on platform ready to load) |
| SSPO3 | Britomart external (Queen St) enhanced corralling management and PA system; AT 'site manager' linked to AT communications management system and Veolia operations management system |
| SSPO4 | Britomart external (Takutai Sq) enhanced corralling management and PA system; AT 'site manager' linked to AT communications management system and Veolia operations management system |
| SSPO5 | Peripheral platform loadings and crowd management, 1 'station manager' to have presence and also manage crowd flow if necessary; similar to after U2 at Penrose. Also can be contact with CCR (Veolia control Room) and direct crowds to scheduled services or 'order' contingency if disruption |
| SSPO6 | Police: input and review rail security proposals; plan to include presence on trains and at stations |
| SSPO7 | All main public access points between Eden Park & Britomart: security presence |
| Communications | |
| Comms1 | Communications Plan will identify full range of options (car, PT, walking, private car) available for travel to the games and Downtown FanZone |
| Comms2 | Confirm chain of command and responsibilities across comms incl. potential new Communications Management Layer with linked comms across Veolia and MAXX channels. Improved linkages between Veolia comms, MAXX, MAXX CCR and MEOC on messages |
| Comms3 | Separate on-board announcer additional to Train Manager (TM) with wireless or stood by microphone to make announcements across all services |
| Comms4 | 1-on-1 briefing of all TMs this week on announcements |
| Comms5 | Veolia CCR Communications Supervisor to remain at post and manage comms, incl communicating specific station and train messages for station PA, on-board txt and MAXX general channels |
| Comms6 | MAXX Communications Supervisor in CCR alongside Veolia Communications Supervisor to receive information and manage MAXX communication channels (Contact Centre, Website, Ambassadors). Chain of command of comms to MAXX Ambassadors through this role. |
| Comms7 | Real-time updates on MAXX website from in-CCR MAXX Communications Supervisor - advertise in advance. Use for redirection to scheduled services, etc. |
| Comms8 | Monitor social media for issues and use to post messages (assistant to MAXX Communications Supervisor in CCR) |
| Comms9 | More (20) MAXX Ambassadors outside Britomart, at Newmarket - incl. information on local scheduled services, taxi ranks, etc. |
| Comms10 | Ensure on-board automated messaging operating |
| Comms11 | On-board communications to include warning that use of emergency stop button should only be used in emergency and will bring the train to a stop preventing quick travel to next station |
| On-board Environment | |
| OBE1 | Dedicated resource and processes to check that air-conditioning working and set to lowest at Westfield and Bmart |
| OBE2 | Loading policy: limit loads at Britomart and direct excess loads to new Downtown to EP bus service |
| OBE3 | Loading policy: limit loads on peripheral stations on each rail line and direct excess loads to strategically positioned bus service(s) - link to Bus Services action 1 below |
| Operational contingency Response Management | |
| OCRM1 | Bus Contingency Plan confirmed, incl. priority of pick-up excess rail passengers linked to new limited loading policy. |
| Bus Services | |
| Bus1 | Increase bus service contingency (emergency response) for each line to cover stranded train (located at stations): 30 |
| Bus2 | Bus services from rail stations to EP (or CBD) located at stations: 40 buses |
| Bus3 | 100 additional buses : New Downtown to EP bus service (50 to 60 buses) - to cover for Britomart rail excess load from new loading policy plus additional passenger volume contingency |
| Bus4 | Management and corralling (esp. split between scheduled CBD and special EP services) at Busway stations |
| Traffic Management Plans | |
| TMP1 | Review event TMPs to ensure contingency for increased private vehicle use, including parking provision and safe walking access |
| TMP2 | Ensure close liaison with event organisers around likely crowd numbers and contingency plans |

12 September 2011

Mr Chris Moore
Meredith Connell
55 – 65 Shortland Street
Auckland

Dear Mr Moore

**TERMS OF REFERENCE – URGENT INDEPENDENT INQUIRY INTO PUBLIC
TRANSPORT PERFORMANCE - FRIDAY 9 SEPTEMBER 2011**

Thank you for agreeing to conduct this independent inquiry. This serves to confirm the Terms of Reference agreed with you.

PURPOSE OF THE INQUIRY

The purpose of your inquiry is to enable Auckland Transport to report to the Mayor of Auckland regarding the circumstances giving rise to the perceived breakdown of public transport arrangements, with particular regard to train, ferry and bus operations for the Rugby World Cup events in Auckland on Friday 9 September 2011.

YOUR ENGAGEMENT

Your role is to conduct an urgent independent inquiry, reporting to Auckland Transport.

It is for you to determine the most efficient and effective procedure, having regard to the urgency of the matter and within the following guidelines.

- a. We are making available to you separately and immediately the following information:
- current contract between Auckland Transport and Veolia Transport;
 - correspondence between Auckland Transport and Veolia Transport with particular regard to rail operations for the Rugby World Cup;
 - current contract between Auckland Transport and Fullers
 - correspondence between Auckland Transport and Fullers with particular regard to ferry operations for the Rugby World Cup;
 - current contracts between Auckland Transport and NZ Bus, Ritchies, Howick & Eastern and other bus operators;
 - correspondence between Auckland Transport and the bus operators with particular regard to bus operations for the Rugby World Cup;
 - current contract between Auckland Transport and KiwiRail for the maintenance of the trains.

- b. Because of the time constraints, there are to be no hearings, as such. Instead, you are asked to adopt an inquisitorial approach, being free to request information from whomsoever you deem appropriate.
- c. Bearing in mind the principles of law contained in the Privy Council decision relating to the Erebus Inquiry, please ensure that if you find it necessary to make significant criticisms of any person or organisation, that that person or organisation has had an opportunity to consider the criticism and comment on it to you. Any such person or organisation will have to accept the tight timeframe within which we are working.
- d. The operation of all public transport on the day in question was under the control of:
- Veolia Transport in relation to trains;
 - Fullers in relation to ferries; and
 - NZ Bus, Ritchies, Howick & Eastern and other bus operators in relation to bus operations.
- e. In view of the importance of having available effective public transport for Rugby World Cup supporters and patrons, and considering that that these events will be continuing over the next six weeks, it is important for Auckland Transport, Auckland Council, the Minister for the Rugby World Cup and the public of Auckland to have as clear an understanding as possible as to why the public transport demands during the late afternoon and evening of Friday 9 September 2011 were not met, taking into consideration that all operations had to be conducted with safety of paramount importance. We also need to ensure that what happened on that day is not repeated.
- f. As agreed, given the time constraints in finalising your report, we do not expect you to make extensive recommendations.

ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANCE

If you find it helpful to work out of a private and dedicated area within the offices of Auckland Transport, we will provide you with secretarial and other administrative assistance and a private meeting room.

If you require any further information or assistance, please do not hesitate to contact me through my Executive Secretary, Debbie Hickson and her contact details are as follows:

DDI: 539 7302

Fax: 539 7335

Email: dhickson@water.co.nz

Yours faithfully

Mark Ford
Chairman
Auckland Transport

MATCH DAY FULL REPORT

| | | |
|---------------------------------|--|--|
| Match: | Japan v France | |
| Date: | 10 September 2011 (North Harbour) | |
| Report by: | Bruce Barnard | |
| Patron Numbers | | |
| Match venue attendance: | Projected attendance: 28,500 | Ticket sales (CONF): |
| | Fan Zone | |
| Overall special event patronage | 6500 (23%) | 10800 (38%) |
| Bus Patronage | In: 6500 (Bush Rd- 800, Orewa – 500, Midtown 2400, North Shore – 2000, Henderson – 400, South 400) | Out: 10800 (Bush Rd- 800, Orewa – 800, Midtown 5900, North Shore – 2400, Henderson – 400, South 500) |
| Rail Patronage | In: N/A | Out: N/A |
| Ferry Patronage | In: N/A | Out: N/A |
| FanTrail | In: N/A | Out: N/A |

Highlights

1. Very quiet on the roads and motorway, both pre and post event.
2. Good numbers utilised Bush Rd parking area.
3. Bus patrons cleared in 65 minutes post match.

Issues / Lessons Learned**Management Approach**

- | | |
|---|---|
| 1. Hooton's Car Park C had over 50 cars parked in the area | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Car Park not secured properly overnight with cars getting into the area. Cars repositioned in back of car park with tow truck to allow the area to be used for bus storage. |
| 2. Egress phase: SH17 eastbound congested delaying the return | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided green time for right hand turn Albany Hwy to SH17. To improve operation, remove left hand turn Oteha |

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| journey for the Bush Rd shuttle | Valley Rd south to east onto SH17 in future (change TMP to suit). |
|---------------------------------|---|

MATCH DAY FULL REPORT

| | | |
|---------------------------------|--|---|
| Match: | Australia v Italy | |
| Date: | 11 September 2011 (North Harbour) | |
| Report by: | Bruce Barnard | |
| Patron Numbers | | |
| Match venue attendance: | Projected attendance: 25,000 | Ticket sales (CONF): |
| | Fan Zone | |
| Overall special event patronage | 7500 (29%) | 8200 (32%) |
| Bus Patronage | In: 7500 (Bush Rd- 700, Orewa – 300, Midtown - 3750, North Shore – 1950, Henderson – 400, South - 400) | Out: 8200 (Bush Rd- 650, Orewa – 350, Midtown 4400, North Shore – 2100, Henderson – 400, South 300) |
| Rail Patronage | In: N/A | Out: N/A |
| Ferry Patronage | In: N/A | Out: N/A |
| FanTrail | In: N/A | Out: N/A |

Highlights

1. Quiet on the roads and motorway pre event. Post event some pressure on SH17 but all clear 75 minutes post game.
2. Good numbers utilised Bush Rd parking area again.
3. Bus patrons cleared in 60 minutes post match.
4. TMP lifted 65 minutes post match
5. TMP worked very well with the learning's applied from 10th September.

| Issues / Lessons Learned | Management Approach |
|---|---|
| 1. Minor changes need to TMP recommended by Audit. | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• All modifications that were implemented took place and were successful. |
| 2. Bus operation went extremely well and an operational change on the Bush Road shuttle route management was needed to facilitate ease of access to SH17. | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Change made and will be implemented for next 2 events. |