

PROJECT **UNITARY PLAN PARKING RATES**
SUBJECT **PARKING PROVISION RATES FOR RETAIL**
TO **KATHERINE DOROFAEFF, AUCKLAND COUNCIL**
FROM MAIRI JOYCE
REVIEWED BY BRONWYN COOMER-SMIT
DATE 20 DECEMBER 2012

1 INTRODUCTION

In 2011 Auckland Council (Council) commissioned Flow Transportation Specialists Ltd (Flow) to investigate options to identify the number of parking and loading spaces which should be required or permitted in the Auckland Unitary Plan (outside of the Auckland City Centre). The aim was to implement the strategic approach to parking contained in the Auckland Regional Land Transport Strategy 2010-2040 (RLTS) and the Auckland Regional Parking Strategy 2009. Flow's findings and recommendations are outlined in a report dated 17 January 2012. At the same time, Transport Planning Solutions Ltd (TPS) was commissioned to complete a similar piece of work for the Auckland City Centre, and outlined their findings and recommendations in a report dated 25 January 2012. Further to this, Flow was commissioned to recommend parking provision rules for the City Centre Fringe Area, with the findings outlined in a further report dated 29 June 2012. It is also acknowledged that the TPS report and the Flow reports of 17 January 2012 and 29 June 2012 are subject to ongoing review by Council as part of the development of parking and loading provisions for the Unitary Plan.

We also note that the Auckland Plan, which was adopted by the Council in March 2012, indicates that the Council intends to review its approach to parking as part of the development of the Unitary Plan. Specifically Directive 10.6 in the Auckland Plan states:

"Parking standards and innovative parking mechanisms should take account of multiple objectives, including the need to:

- ◆ *facilitate intensive and mixed-use developments within strategic locations*
- ◆ *improve housing affordability*
- ◆ *reduce development costs*
- ◆ *encourage use of public transportation*
- ◆ *optimise investments in public parking facilities, civic amenities and centre developments*
- ◆ *foster safe, convenient and attractive walkable neighbourhoods."*

As part of the development of the Unitary Plan, the proposed parking provision rates (as well as other elements of the Unitary Plan) have been discussed within Council (including with Local Boards) and with key stakeholders.

As part of the consultation with key stakeholders Council met with the Key Retailers Group on 29 November 2012 to discuss their concerns with the proposed parking provision rules for retail land uses. Flow was present with Council at that meeting. The Key Retailers Group includes representatives of Westfield, Bunnings, Kiwi Income Property Trust, The Warehouse, Countdown, and Foodstuffs). The key concerns outlined in the meeting by the Key Retailers Group are:

- ◆ The adoption of maximum parking rates as a means to reduce private traffic travel and hence congestion, and promote the use of public transport during the peak commuter times are not appropriate for retail land uses, as the majority of retail trips take place out of peak commuter and public transport availability times. Trips undertaken during peak times are often drive by trips. In addition, many types of retail (specifically malls, supermarkets and large format retail) require the use of private vehicles
- ◆ Maximum parking rates are not required to prevent parking oversupply because businesses will provide the amount of parking they need to operate
- ◆ If car parking provision for retail activities in centres is insufficient to meet demand, as a result of the imposition of maximum parking rates, then there will be a shift in patronage to other retail stores or shopping centres, or the development of new retail activities outside of centres, where more parking is available (as these areas will not have a maximum parking rate provision). Therefore restrictive parking provision rules through the introduction of parking maximum rates in urban centres will discourage development of retail in these areas and result in encouraging out of centre developments. The Key Retailers Group is arguing that this is in direct conflict with the aims and objectives of the Auckland Regional Policy Statement Change 6 which aims to encourage growth around urban centres
- ◆ Supermarkets and Discount Department Stores should not be aggregated into the “general retail” category. The group argues that these store types tend to generate parking demand which is nearly twice that of Large Format Retail
- ◆ Applying different parking rates to ground and mezzanine levels and above ground floors for retail activities is problematic
- ◆ The removal of minimum parking rates in centres is problematic as this may result in various landuse activities providing no, or too little parking to meet their demand and as such visitors to these landuses will rely on parking provided by other developments. This is undesirable to the larger retailers who typically provide large parking areas.

The Key Retailers advised that they did not have any specific interest in the parking maximums proposed for the city centre zone.

As a result of this feedback, Council has commissioned Flow to consider several aspects of these issues and this Technical Note outlines our findings. As part of this review we met with key members of staff from Auckland Council and Auckland Transport on 6 December 2012 to discuss the feedback from the Key Retailers Group regarding retail parking outside the city centre zone. Recommendations from this meeting have been incorporated into this Technical Note.

2 PROPOSED UNITARY PLAN RETAIL PARKING RATES

The proposed Unitary Plan parking rates for retail land uses in the various zones and locations as at 22 November are outlined in Table 1. Parking maximums are applied in and around centres, and along mixed use corridors¹. These are areas identified by their zoning as having potential for change and intensification. Most of these areas are located on the frequent public transport network, or will be so within the next ten years².

Table 1: Proposed Unitary Plan Retail Rates as at 22 November 2012

Zone	Land Use Classification	Rate
City Centre Zone	All land uses (except residential)	Maximum of 1:200 m ² GFA
Parking overlay for City Centre Fringe Area; Metropolitan, Town and Local Centres zones; Mixed use zone; Terraced Housing and Apartments zone	All Retail and Other (excluding residential, office, care centres, educational facilities, and medical facilities)	Maximum of 1 per 25 m ² for ground and mezzanine floors and 1 per 35 m ² GFA above ground floors
All Other Areas	General Retail	Minimum of 1 per 25 m ² GFA for areas open to the public
	Food Service based retail	Minimum of 1 per 15 m ² GFA

3 MAXIMUM PARKING RATES FOR GENERAL RETAIL

3.1 Principle

Taking into account our discussions with officers from Auckland Council and Auckland Transport as well as the results of the work that we have already completed, we have re-considered the use of maximum parking rates for retail land uses in urban centres and make the following points.

The provision of maximum parking rates in urban centres (when used in conjunction with appropriate parking management techniques and land use zoning) can help encourage the following outcomes which are consistent with Directive 10.6 of the Unitary Plan, the Auckland Regional Land Transport Strategy 2010-2040 (RLTS) and the Auckland Regional Parking Strategy 2009 (See Section 1):

- ◆ Increased density
- ◆ Improved urban form and amenity
- ◆ Increased use of public transport, walking and cycling.

¹ In this technical note the term 'urban centres' refers to the areas in and around the city centre, metropolitan, town and local centre zones, and along the mixed use corridors, where the parking maximums apply.

² 13 local centres are not proposed to be on the frequent public transport network by 2022 ie Addison, Albany Village, Beach Haven, Dawson Road, Drury, Favona, Greville, Gulf Harbour, Hingaia, Long Bay, Meadowlands, Titirangi, Torbay.

Having considered the concerns raised by the Key Retailers Group, the application of maximum parking rates (with no minimums) specifically to retail activities in urban centres is still considered to be advantageous for the following reasons:

- ◆ Contributes to the overall reduction in parking in urban centres (thus contributing to the aims and objectives outlined above)
- ◆ Encourages staff of retail activities to use more sustainable forms of transport such as public transport, walking, cycling and car pooling etc
- ◆ Establishes a direction for the future by Council indicating a change in approach to parking supply for all land uses which can be managed further in the future as public transport improves and urban centres increase in density and mix of uses
- ◆ Helps to encourage customers of retail activities to walk/cycle/take public transport, thus reducing congestion and improving the amenity of urban centres
- ◆ Avoids the risk of retailers using land in urban centres for excessive parking or potentially leasing extra parking spaces to other land uses (for example office commuters etc) rather than using it for future development.

As a result of the above points, we consider that maximum rates should be retained for retail activities in urban centres, but that the level at which the rate is set should be re-considered to reflect the concerns raised by the Key Retailers Group. In particular, we accept the matters raised by the group about the off-peak nature of most retail trips. We also accept that some retail uses are less suited to public transport trips than other land uses such as offices or educational facilities which generate a higher number of commuter trips. Setting the maximum rates for retail at a more permissive level will establish a direction for the future and place an upper limit on the amount of parking that can be provided. However it will be less effective than a more restrictive rate at contributing to the overall reduction of parking in urban centres, and at encouraging greater use of public transport, walking and cycling.

3.2 Parking Provision Rate

As discussed above, in response to the concerns raised by the Key Retailers Group we have re-considered the rate at which the maximum parking provision rate for general retail should be set. To reflect the fact that Auckland is currently in a transition stage with regard to the frequency, reliability and extent of public transport services and that it is undesirable to discourage retail development in urban centres, we recommend that the maximum rate be increased to allow retailers to provide parking to meet the current demand. This proposed maximum rate can then be used to set an upper limit which will control the negative effects of the oversupply of parking (encouraging vehicle use, inefficient use of land, urban sprawl etc), but which will not be too restrictive so as to encourage significant retail growth out of centres. This also allows Council to set a direction for how parking supply will be managed in the future.

We have accordingly re-reviewed the minimum parking rates used in the current District Plans for retail activities, as well as industry standard documents and available survey data for key retail uses and have also taken into account suggestions for an appropriate maximum parking rate for retail

activities made by the Key Retailers Group’s traffic engineer (Brett Harries of Traffic Design Group). As such we consider a maximum parking provision rate of 1:20 m² GFA (as opposed to 1:25 m² GFA) is appropriate for general retail. In this regard we understand that the Key Retailers Group may have access to additional parking demand data and we recommend this data be reviewed and the above rate of 1:20 m² GFA be re-considered in light of this new information when provided.³

It is noted that the proposed parking provision rules for urban centres classify retail with all other land uses (excluding residential, office, care centres, educational facilities and medical facilities). Therefore changing the rate for general retail to 1:20 m² will result in the same change for the “all other” land use category also. We consider the most common land uses to fall in this category are likely to be:

- ◆ Commercial Services (travel agent, customer banking facilities, drycleaning, hairdressing etc)
- ◆ Medical laboratories
- ◆ Community facilities
- ◆ Entertainment facilities such as cinemas and theatres.

We have reviewed the existing minimum parking provision rules included in the various sections of the District Plans for the land uses identified above and summarised them in Table 2.

Table 2: Comparison of Existing Minimum District Plan Rates

Land Use	Auckland Isthmus	North Shore	Manukau	Rodney
Banks	N/A	1:30 m ²	1:35 m ²	1:25 m ²
Hairdressing and Beauty salons	N/A	N/A	1:20 m ²	N/A
Laundries	N/A	1:30 m ²	N/A	N/A
Medical laboratories	1:50 m ²	1:50 m ²	N/A	
Community facilities	1:20 m ²	1:20 m ²	N/A	1 per 3 persons the facility is designed to accommodate
Cinemas and Theatres		1 per 4 people the building is designed to accommodate plus 1 per two employees	1 per 3.5 people the building is designed to accommodate	1 per 3 people the building is designed to accommodate plus 1 per 1.3 employees

Overall it is considered that the risk associated with providing excess parking with these land uses is relatively low due to the fact that the number of these land uses within each centre will be limited. Further, based on data above, it is considered that a rate of 1:20 m² could be considered to be unrestrictive for the majority of these land uses and for simplicity reasons it makes sense to retain the land use category of “retail and other land uses” at 1:20 m². There may be instances where a

³ Brett Harries advised Flow on 4 December that TDG was assisting the Key Retailers Group to assemble further information about parking rates for a number of retail activities including supermarkets. The Group will want to provide this to the council in a comprehensive manner.

developer may want to provide parking in excess of this amount; however it is considered this is best dealt with as a restricted discretionary activity consent.

3.3 Differentiation of Parking Rates for Ground and Above Ground Levels

The proposed parking provision rates for retail include a reduced maximum rate for above ground floors. This approach is adopted from Plan Change 13 and 14 (Massey North and Hobsonville town centres) to the Waitakere Section of the Auckland District Plan. This is in recognition of the fact that activities which are accessed by the public (and therefore may require visitor parking) tend to be located on ground and mezzanine floor levels. Feedback from Council's Built Environment Team also suggested that further vertical differentiation of car parking requirements should be considered, through reducing requirements further for second floors and above. The reason for this is to allow flexibility for future land use changes, particularly in centres and mixed use zones.

However, it is considered this differentiation of parking provision rules across different levels is difficult to justify without case specifics. In addition, we accept the feedback from the Key Retailers Group, that this may be problematic to apply and does not necessarily reflect how multi-level shopping centres operate. We therefore consider that the proposed differentiation should be removed from the general retail and other categories. It can be re-considered at a later date when more information is available. There may be an argument to apply the differentiation to different levels to specific zones, for example the mixed use zone, however this should be based on evidence produced through further work.

4 DISCUSSION ON RETAIL LAND USE CATEGORIES

4.1 Key Issues Raised

The Key Retailers Group has also raised concerns regarding the aggregation of all retail categories into one "general retail" category. Specifically they have concerns regarding Large Format Retail (LFR), Supermarkets and Discount Department Stores (such as The Warehouse and Kmart).

We note that the meeting with the Key Retailers Group included consideration of a version of the parking provision rates dated 26 November 2012 which included some suggested rates for Bulky Goods Retail and Trade Suppliers.

The proposed Unitary Plan includes categories for Large Format Retail, Department Stores and Trade Suppliers (which is intended to include stores such as Bunnings and Mitre Ten). The terms Large Format Retail, Department Stores and Trade Suppliers are defined and these terms are used in activity tables. In light of the concerns raised by the Key Retailers Group, we have re-considered the proposed parking provision rules for these categories. The different categories are discussed in the following sections.

4.2 Large Format Retail Parking Rates

4.2.1 Outline of Available Evidence

The proposed Unitary Plan definition of LFR includes *“any individual shop tenancy with a floor area greater than 450 m², where the tenancy is created freehold, leasehold, licence or any other arrangement to occupy (excluding food and beverage premises and trade suppliers)”*. Sub categories include Supermarkets and Department Stores.

Department Stores are identified as a shop generally organised into departments where no one merchandise line dominates (examples are The Warehouse, Kmart, Farmers and Briscoes).

Supermarkets are identified as retail outlets which sell a comprehensive range of domestic supplies such as food and personal goods and where non domestic supplies (such as magazines, DVDs etc) comprise no more than 20 % of all the total retail floor space.

Home Improvement retail outlets such as “Mitre Ten” and “Bunnings” are intended to be classified as Trade Suppliers in the Unitary Plan, as further discussed below. As such there are currently no separate sub-categories in the Unitary Plan for Comprehensive Shopping Centres or Bulky Goods Retail stores (such as furniture and home appliance stores) which are known to have different parking requirements than the above described Large Format sub-categories of Supermarkets, Department Stores and Trade Suppliers. At present as Bulky Goods Retail land uses are generally over 450 m², these would also be classified under Large Format Retail under the proposed Unitary Plan definitions. Shopping Centres may be a mix of general Retail and Large Format Retail, depending on the size of the individual shop tenancies.

We have been advised the only use of the term Large Format Retail in the business zone activity tables is for the purposes of identifying it as a prohibited activity in the heavy industry zone, and a non-complying activity in the light industry zone. In the activity tables for the other business zones, the term used is ‘retail greater than 450m² GFA per site’.

We have reviewed the existing parking rates for Large Format Retail in the general parking rules of the current Auckland District Plans as well as the standard industry documents such as the RTA Guide to Traffic Generating Developments (RTA, 2002), the Transfund New Zealand Research Report No 209, Trips and Parking related to Land Use (NZTA, 2001) and the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) Parking Generation Guide. In addition to this we have also reviewed traffic reports prepared for Large Format Retail sites which Flow have either prepared or reviewed. The relevant available rates for each land use category are outlined below.

4.2.2 Shopping Centres

The available data for Shopping Centres is outlined in Table 3.

Table 3: Shopping Centre Rates

Source	Land Use	Rate *
Auckland District Plan – North Shore Section	Comprehensively designed shopping centres	0-6,000 m ² GLA: 1 per 16 m ² then for next 4,000 m ² GLA: 1 per 20 m ² then for next 10,000 m ² GLA: 1 per 22m ² for over 20,000 m ² GLA: 1 per 25 m ²
RTA Guide	Shopping Centres	1-10,000 m ² GLA - 1 per 16.4 m ² GLA, 10,000-20,000 m ² GLA - 1 per 17.9 m ² GLA 20,000-30,000 m ² GLA - 1 per 23.3 m ² GLA 30,000m ² - 1 per 24.4m ² GLA
NZ Trips and Parking Database	Shopping Centres	Average of 1 space per 20 m ² GFA (selecting ten relevant shopping centres in Auckland only)
Transit NZ Research Report No 209	Shopping Centres	0 – 4,000 GFA: 1 per 12.5 m ² GFA 4,001-10,000 GFA: 1 per 15 m ² GFA Over 10,001 GFA: 1 per 18.5 m ² GFA (based on 85 % surveyed satisfaction)
Information from Westfield Traffic Assessments	Westfield Shopping Centres	1 per 20 m ² GLA or 1 per 22 m ² GFA
Actual survey of peak parking demand (Saturday 2011)	Milford Shopping Mall	1 per 20 m ² GFA
Actual survey of peak parking demand (2006 and 2007)	Sylvia Park Shopping Mall (including warehouse and supermarkets)	Ranging from 1 per 19 m ² to 1 per 27 m ² GFA (with the rate decreasing as the centre gets bigger)

*Note that some rates are provided in Gross Leasable Floor Area (GLA) and some or in Gross Floor Area (GFA). Where the exact GFA of an activity is unknown, a 10% addition to GLA is applied, which is found to be a typical factor for shopping centres⁴

There are a number of surveys which can be examined to determine rates for Shopping Centres as opposed to stand alone retail outlets. However, it is noted that the rates provided in Table 3 are based on surveys of Shopping Centres of a variety of sizes and therefore cannot reasonably be averaged to create a single rate. The North Shore section of the Auckland District Plan is the only section which currently includes different rates for comprehensively designed shopping centres and supermarkets in its general parking rates. It is acknowledged that large shopping centres (such as Westfield shopping centres which often include supermarkets) do have different characteristics than stand alone retail stores. In some cases District Plans have provided site specific parking standards via a plan change or resource consent, for this type of use. The evidence shows that for these larger Shopping Centres, the average peak parking demand tends to be around one parking space per 22 m² GFA.

⁴ Evidence to Auckland City Council on Westfields St Lukes Stage 2 resource consent hearing, Brett Harries, Traffic Design Group 2010.

As outlined in previous Table 1, the proposed Unitary Plan rates differ depending on the zoning and location. Overall we consider that the minimum rate proposed for retail activities outside of areas where maximums apply (ie one parking space per 25 m² GFA) is appropriate for Shopping Centres as this rate permits the applicant to provide a rate in excess of this (for example one space per 20 m² GFA) if they wish. This would, for example, cater for a block of local shops in the neighbourhood centre zone where only parking minimums apply.

For the areas where parking maximums apply the revised proposed rates permit a maximum rate of one parking space per 20 m² GFA. This meets the peak parking demand surveyed at Shopping Centres (1 per 20 m² to 1 per 22 m² GFA). As a result it is considered that the proposed maximum parking rate is not restrictive and should therefore not discourage development within centres.

It is noted that these maximum rates do apply to 13 local centres which are not planned to be on the frequent public transport network by 2022. For these centres, applicants may argue that they should be permitted an increased maximum rate (or no maximum rate) on the basis that the travel choices are not yet available. However, we consider that the same rates should remain as once a large parking area is built, it can be difficult for Council to have any influence over whether it is reduced in the future. In addition, the Key Retailers Group noted the importance of having a consistent approach to parking across the region so that retail activities do not seek the areas with more permissive parking standards. There may be agreements which can be made regarding allowing an increased parking rate on a temporary basis, however it is considered this should be determined on a case by case basis through the consents process. The draft parking, loading and access rules provide for applications to exceed the maximum parking rates to be considered as restricted discretionary activities.

4.2.3 Bulky Goods Stores

The available data for Bulky Goods Retail is outlined in Table 4.

Table 4: Bulky Goods Store Rates

Source	Land Use	Rate
Auckland District Plan – North Shore Section	Furniture Showrooms	1 space per 40 m ² GFA
RTA Guide	Bulky Goods Retail Stores	No conclusive rate provided but surveyed rates were generally lower than normal retail rates
NZ Trips and Parking Database	Large Format Retail	Ranging from 1 per 28 m ² GFA to 1 per 50 m ² (based on supply not demand)(Selecting five relevant bulky goods stores in Auckland only)
Transit NZ Research Report no 209	Bulky Goods Retail Stores	1 per 33 m ² GFA (based on 85% surveyed satisfaction)
ITE Manual	Furniture Stores	1 per 43 m ² GFA plus one per 3.5 employees

Table 4: Bulky Goods Store Rates

Source	Land Use	Rate
Surveys of peak parking demand at bulk retail on Mt Wellington Highway and St Lukes shopping centre	Bulky Goods Retail Stores	Average of 1 space per 36 m ² GFA (note average also includes St Lukes shopping centre which cannot be totally classed as bulky goods)
Napier, Large Format Retail Zone, Traffic Overview Report, prepared by TDG ⁵	Furniture and whiteware stores	Ranging between 1 per 43 m ² and 1 per 66 m ² (based on a range of published data and other surveys held by TDG from throughout New Zealand)

It is noted that the proposed Unitary Plan does not include a specific category for what is traditionally known as Bulky Goods Retail. This term is not currently defined in the Unitary Plan or used in activity tables. Bulky Goods Retail includes stores selling home appliances and furniture. It is generally recognised that these stores attract a lower parking rate than standard retail, due to the size of the stock they are selling and therefore the requirement for a larger GFA. However, the evidence available does not provide a clear indication of an average rate. This is probably as a result of the definition of a Bulky Goods store being unclear and variable, as traditionally stores such as Bunnings, Mitre Ten and The Warehouse may also have been classified under this category. It is noted that the RTA Guide defines Bulky Goods Retail Stores as *“a building or place which sells homewares such as furniture, electrical appliances and lighting, or material for the home, such as carpet and building materials.”*

Overall we consider that there is an argument for reducing the minimum parking rate required for bulky goods stores located outside of the areas where parking maximums apply. We suggest a rate of a minimum of one space per 35 m² GFA is appropriate. Consideration could also be given to reducing the maximum rate for Bulky Goods Retail in urban centres, to reduce the risk of oversupply of parking for these retail types. However, it is considered that this is not critical as the instances of very large Large Format Retail stores in urban centre zones is anticipated to be low due to the cost associated with the floor areas required and the difficulty in acquiring or assembling large enough sites.

It is also noted that a definition of Bulky Goods Retail included in the Unitary Plan will need to be clear that it does not include Trade Suppliers retail outlets such as Bunnings and Mitre Ten and Discount Department Stores such as the Warehouse and Kmart.

We note that the reduced minimum rate for Bulky Goods Retail is really only of relevance to the extent to which the Unitary Plan provides for such stores to locate outside the parking maximum areas. In this regard the proposed Business Zone rules supplied to us only provide for Retail of greater than 450m² GFA in the following zones: Metropolitan Centre, Town Centre, Local Centre, Mixed Use, General Business, and Business Park. Parking maximums are not proposed to apply to the General Business and Business Park zones so these are the only zones where the suggested minimum parking rates for Bulky Goods Retail are of direct relevance. We note that retail greater than 450 GFA m² per site is proposed to be a restricted discretionary activity in the General Business zone

⁵ Traffic Design Group, 2008, Large Format Retail Zone, Prebensen Drive, Napier, Traffic Overview

and a discretionary activity in the Business Park zone. Given that a resource consent is already required, the parking requirements for the specific proposal could be considered as part of the application.

4.2.4 Supermarkets and Discount Department Stores

The available data for Supermarkets and Discount Department Stores is outlined in Table 5 and Table 6.

Table 5: Supermarket Rates

Source	Land Use	Rate
Auckland District Plan – North Shore Section	Supermarkets	0-6,000 m ² Gross Leasable Area (GLA): 1 per 16 m ² then for next 4,000 m ² GLA: 1 per 20 m ² then for next 10,000 m ² GLA: 1 per 22 m ² for over 20,000 m ² GLA: 1 per 25 m ²
NZ Trips and Parking Database	Supermarkets	Average of 1 per 23.2 m ² GFA (based on surveyed peak demand at three supermarkets in Auckland)
Transit NZ Research Report no 209	Supermarkets	1 per 13.3 m ² GFA (based on 85% surveyed satisfaction)
ITE Manual	Supermarkets	1 per 14 m ² GFA at suburban sites 1 per 43 m ² GFA at rural sites 1 per 31 m ² GFA at urban sites
Napier, Large Format Retail Zone, Traffic Overview Report, prepared by TDG ⁶	Supermarkets	Ranging between 1 per 19 m ² and 1 per 24 m ² (based on a range of published data and other surveys held by TDG from throughout New Zealand)

Table 6: Discount Department Stores Rates

Source	Land Use	Rate
NZ Trips and Parking Database	The Warehouse	Two Auckland The Warehouse sites surveyed peak demand ranging from 1 per 12 m ² to 1 per 35 m ² GFA
Surveys of peak parking demand on Saturday at The Warehouse stores in Auckland (undertaken by Flow and Opus consultants)	The Warehouse	Average of 1 per 25 m ² GFA (1 per 28 m ² , 1 per 21 m ² and 1 per 25 m ² GFA), based on three survey sites in Auckland
Napier, Large Format Retail Zone, Traffic Overview Report, prepared by TDG ⁷	High mix product base	Ranging between 1 per 19 m ² and 1 per 36 m ² (based on a range of published data and other surveys held by TDG from throughout New Zealand)

⁶ Traffic Design Group, 2008, Large Format Retail Zone, Prebensen Drive, Napier, Traffic Overview

⁷ Traffic Design Group, 2008, Large Format Retail Zone, Prebensen Drive, Napier, Traffic Overview

For Supermarkets we are unable to find evidence to suggest that supermarkets in New Zealand require significantly less parking than the suggested minimum rate of one space per 25 m² GFA outside of the parking maximum areas. In addition, we have little data for parking demand associated with stand alone supermarkets in urban areas, as in urban centres many supermarkets are included in the shopping centres. However, given the information available, it is considered that the proposed maximum rate of 1:20 m² GFA is appropriate. We are unable to provide evidence to suggest that supermarkets in New Zealand would require more parking than this provides for. However, we understand that the Key Retailers Group has concerns with this rate and has evidence based on developments they are involved with to suggest that the parking demand for supermarkets is significantly higher than this. It is therefore, recommended that this rate be re-considered when this evidence is provided by the Key Retailers Group.

From the view point of assessing parking, the proposed category of Discount Department Stores presents some difficulties. The definition indicates that this classification is intended to include stores such as The Warehouse, but in reality this is probably one of the very few examples of stand alone Discount Department Stores which still occur, for example almost all Kmart's and Farmers stores, and many The Warehouse stores are contained within Shopping Centres. However, the Key Retailer's Group has raised concerns regarding the rate for discount department stores (The Warehouse and Briscoes), specifically stating that the proposed maximum of 1:25 m² is too restrictive. We have reviewed the data available from a variety of surveys for The Warehouse and consider that the revised proposed maximum rate of 1:20 m² is appropriate for these types of stores in urban centres.

4.3 Trade Suppliers Parking Rates

4.3.1 Outline of Available Evidence

Trade Suppliers is also described as a subset of retail in the proposed Unitary Plan and is defined as *“a business engaged in sales to businesses and institutional customers and may also include sales to the general public, and wholly consists of suppliers of goods in one or more of the following industries – automotive and marine suppliers, building suppliers, catering equipment suppliers, farming and agricultural suppliers, garden and patio suppliers, hire premises, industrial clothing and safety equipment specialists and office furniture, equipment and systems suppliers.”* It is noted that the sub category of building suppliers (which is also defined) is intended to include home improvement stores such as Mitre Ten and Bunnings.

As for Large Format Retail, we have reviewed the existing parking rates for relevant Trade Suppliers in the current Auckland District Plans as well as the standard industry documents such as the RTA Guide to Traffic Generating Developments (RTA, 2002), the Transfund New Zealand Research Report No 209, Trips and Parking related to Land Use (NZTA, 2001) and the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) Parking Generation Guide.

In addition to this we have also reviewed traffic reports prepared for Trade Supplier sites which Flow have either prepared or reviewed. The relevant available rates for each land use category are outlined in Table 7 and Table 8.

Table 7: Home Improvement Stores

Source	Land Use	Rate
Auckland District Plan – North Shore Section	Home Improvement Centres	1 space per 40 m ² GFA
	Equipment Hire and servicing premises	1 per 40m ² GFA, plus 1 per 100m ² GFA outdoor storage area
Auckland District Plan – Isthmus Section	Building Improvement centres and hire centres	1 per 20 m ² GFA plus 1 per 100 m ² outdoor storage
Auckland District Plan – Manukau Section	Building Improvement centres	1 per 30m ² retail and display area, plus 1 per 40m ² other floor space, plus 1 per 100m ² open space for outdoor display
	Equipment Hire	1 space per 40 m ² GFA
Actual surveys of five stores in Auckland (two Mitre 10 and three Bunnings) on a Saturday	Home Improvement Centres	Average peak parking demand of 1 per 65m ² GFA
Actual survey of three Bunnings stores in the North Island	Home Improvement Centres	Average peak parking demand of 1 space per 45 m ²
Napier, Large Format Retail Zone, Traffic Overview Report, prepared by TDG ⁸	Home building and improvement	Ranging between 1 per 43 m ² and 1 per 66 m ² GFA (based on a range of published data and other surveys held by TDG from throughout New Zealand)

Table 8: Garden Centres

Source	Land Use	Rate
Auckland District Plan – North Shore Section	Garden Centres and Nurseries	1 per 20 m ² GFA, 1 per 100 m ² outdoor/display area
Auckland District Plan – isthmus Section	Garden Centres	1 per 20 m ² GFA plus 1 per 100m ² outdoor area used for display purposes
Auckland District Plan – Manukau Section	Garden Centres and Nurseries	1 per 50m ² gross land area used for garden centre purposes, plus 1 per 2 persons employed on site or operating from site at any one time, plus 1 per 40m ² indoor sales area
NZ Trips and Parking Database	Garden Centres	Three example surveys from Auckland with rates ranging from one space per 10 m ² to one space per 263 m ²

Based on the evidence available, it is recommended that a reduced minimum parking rate for Trade Suppliers be applied outside of the areas where parking maximums apply. We note a reduced minimum rate is really only of relevance to the extent that the Unitary Plan provides for Trade Suppliers to establish outside the parking maximum areas. We note that the Trade Suppliers are

⁸ Traffic Design Group, 2008, Large Format Retail Zone, Prebensen Drive, Napier, Traffic Overview

provided for as restricted discretionary in the Light Industry and General Business zone, and as discretionary in the Business Park zone. Parking minimums, and no maximums, apply in these zones. The parking rates for Trade Suppliers should distinguish between retail areas and outdoor display/storage areas. A proposed minimum rate of one space per 50 m² for internal GFA plus one space per 100 m² GFA of outdoor storage or display area is recommended.

Our recommendations suggest that less parking should be required for Trade Suppliers when compared with Bulky Goods stores. The general assumptions that support this are:

- ◆ Goods sold at Trade Suppliers tend to be larger and therefore take up more GFA per transaction
- ◆ Trade Suppliers tend to store more stock on site thus increasing the GFA of the store. Bulky Goods stores tend to store many goods off site, and then deliver to customers
- ◆ The market for Trade Suppliers is smaller than the market for Bulky Goods stores. Trade suppliers therefore tend to generate fewer customers.

These assumptions are generalisations, and some Trade Suppliers (eg Mega Mitre 10 stores) tend to have more general retail sections than trade supplier sections. However we have used parking demand surveys from stores such as Bunnings and Mega Mitre 10, and they do fit within the rates proposed.

5 ADDITIONAL PROPOSED AMENDMENTS

In addition to re-considering the parking provision rates for retail activities we have also been requested by Council to re consider the following:

- ◆ Maximum parking provision rates for Food Based Retail
- ◆ Minimum parking provision rates for Taverns, Entertainment facilities, Club rooms and Community facilities.

These points are discussed in the following sections.

5.1 Maximum Parking Rate for Food Based Retail

In the parking overlay for the Fringe Area and Urban Centres, there is currently no separate maximum parking rate for Food Based Retail. As such Food Based Retail currently falls into the category of general retail and other with a revised maximum parking provision rate of 1:20 m² GFA. However, outside of the parking maximum area we have recommended an increased minimum rate for Food Based Retail (1:15 m²) over general retail (1:25 m²).

Food Based Retail includes a variety of land uses including restaurants, cafes, take away outlets and fast food facilities (including drive through facilities). It does not include supermarkets, or retail shops such as fruit and vegetable outlets. The parking demand for these various Food Based Retail operations can vary significantly. The existing District Plans tend to provide different rates as outlined below:

- ◆ Takeaway foodbars and cafes – Minimum rate of 1:20 m² GFA

- ◆ Restaurants – ranging from a minimum of one space per three seats plus staff to one space per four persons the facility is designed to accommodate or 1 per 10 m² GFA plus 1 per 15 m² outdoor space (Isthmus).

Many of the District Plans also include requirements for queuing space for drive through facilities. The draft Unitary Plan rules include a requirement that vehicle access must be designed so to avoid queueing onto the road at drive through facilities. As noted in our original report the majority of the industry standard documents include higher rates of between one space per 5 m² and 10 m². In general, fast food outlets such as McDonalds tend to provide more parking than cafes and other restaurants, and currently often provide parking in excess of District Plan requirements.

It is considered that a similar approach should be taken to food based retail in urban centres as for general retail. That is, the maximum parking rate proposed should not be restrictive and therefore allow for current parking demands to be met. On this basis, a maximum rate of 1:10 m² GFA (including GFA used for external seating) is recommended. The existing proposed minimum rate of 1:15 m² GFA is considered appropriate as it allows fast food outlets to provide more parking if required.

5.2 Minimum Parking Rate for Taverns

Taverns are identified in the draft Unitary Plan as “*sites where the primary business is the sale and consumption of liquor on the premises*”. The proposed rates do not include a separate rate for taverns, rather it falls within Food Based Retail with a proposed minimum rate of 1:15 m² GFA. Council has expressed concern that this rate is too high. The existing District Plans include minimum parking provision rates for Taverns based on the number of people the facility is designed to accommodate, ranging from one parking space per 3.5 persons to one parking space per 10 persons the facility is designed to accommodate. The North Shore and the Isthmus sections of the District Plan include a sliding scale with the larger the bar, the more parking spaces required. There appears to be very little data on the actual parking demand for taverns and bars in the industry standard documents, resulting in the existing District Plan rates being the main data source.

Overall, it is considered that the peak use times for taverns and bars do not coincide with peak use times of the majority of other activities such as general retail and offices. As a result the risks associated with effects of parking overspill are somewhat reduced. In more rural areas, the parking demand may be higher and there may not always be appropriate on street parking or alternative transport options. However we note that during the consultation workshops, we received feedback from planners familiar with the Rodney Section of the Auckland District Plan that the rate in the Rodney Section for cafes, bars and taverns was currently set too high (currently set at 1 per every 3.5 people the facility is designed to accommodate plus staff). Given this information, and the range included in the existing District Plans, it is considered a rate of around one space per 6 people the facility is designed to accommodate would be appropriate.

However, for ease of application it is beneficial to convert this into a GFA requirement. The New Zealand Building Code requires a maximum occupancy rate of one person per 1 m² in a seated bar area and two people per m² in a standing bar area (this does not include any areas provided for staff, offices

or storage etc)⁹. However, it is considered that the majority of bars generally have significantly more room than this per customer on an average evening. Assuming approximately 80 % of a bar GFA is open to the public, and an average occupancy rate of 2.5 m² per person (approximately 2.5 times the minimum required by the Building Act), this would equate to a bar being designed for approximately 32 people per 100 m² GFA. For a minimum parking rate of one space per six people, this would equate to a total of five parking spaces per 100 m² or one parking space per 18 m² GFA. Based on this information, it is considered a rate of between 1:15 m² and 1:20 m² GFA would be appropriate for a minimum parking provision rate for taverns. The lower minimum rate of 1:20 m² recognises the fact that this is a minimum rate and in the main, owners are likely to provide sufficient parking to meet their demand. However the risks associated with negative parking overspill effects are higher with the use of this lower rate. Given, the feedback we received during the workshops we recommend a minimum rate of 1:20 m² GFA is used during the public consultation process. However, it is recommended that Council consult with the industry to determine what the average occupancy per m² GFA used as a basis for the design of taverns and bars to test the assumptions used in this analysis.

In terms of a maximum rate for taverns, at this stage it is recommended that the general retail rate of 1:20m² apply.

5.3 Minimum Parking Rate for Entertainment Facilities, Club rooms and Community Facilities

The current proposed minimum parking provision rate for entertainment facilities, club rooms and community facilities in the Unitary Plan is 0.25 spaces per person that the facility is designed to accommodate. This rate is in line with the minimum rates currently used in the various sections of the District Plan. As outlined in our original report dated Jan 2012, based on our principle of reducing the minimum rates from existing standards, we consider the rate could be reduced to one parking space per five people the facility is designed to accommodate.

6 RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the discussion above the proposed amended parking provision rates are outlined in Table 9.

Table 9: Proposed Unitary Plan Retail Rates Including Additional Categories

Zone	Land Use Classification	Rate
City Centre Zone	All land uses (except residential)	Maximum of 1:200 m ² GFA
Parking overlay for City Centre Fringe Area; Metropolitan, Town and Local Centres zones; Mixed Use zone; Terraced Housing and Apartment Buildings	Retail and all other land uses (excluding residential, office, care centres, educational facilities and medical facilities)	Maximum of 1 per 20 m ² GFA
	Food and beverage ¹⁰	Maximum of 1 per 10 m ² GFA and outdoor seating area

⁹ <http://www.dbh.govt.nz/UserFiles/File/Publications/Building/Compliance-documents/G1-personal-hygiene.pdf>

Table 9: Proposed Unitary Plan Retail Rates Including Additional Categories

Zone	Land Use Classification	Rate
zone		
All Other Areas	General Retail	Minimum of 1 per 25 m ² GFA
	Food and beverage	Minimum of 1 per 15 m ² GFA
	Taverns	Minimum of 1 per 20 m ² GFA
	Bulky Goods Retail	Minimum of 1 per 35 m ² GFA
	Trade Suppliers	Minimum of 1 per 50 m ² internal GFA and 1 per 100 m ² of external storage or display area
	Entertainment facilities, club rooms and community facilities	0.2 per persons the facility is designed to accommodate

Reference: S:\ACUP\008 Unitray Plan Ongoing Tasks\Large Format Retail Parking Rate Comparison\TN1C121219_Amendment to Retail Rates.docx - MAIRI

¹⁰ The Unitary Plan definition of 'Food and beverage' encompasses the food based retail discussed at 5.1. It includes drive through restaurants.